

Coder Reliability and Misclassification in the Human Coding of Party Manifestos: Supplementary Materials

Slava Mikhaylov
University College London
v.mikhaylov@ucl.ac.uk

Michael Laver
New York University
michael.laver@nyu.edu

Kenneth Benoit
London School of Economics
kbenoit@lse.ac.uk

September 9, 2011

Complete Category Listing.

Detailed information on categories, reliability, and classification probabilities from tests.

| Code | Description | Overall | | Fleiss κ | | Pr(A* A) = | | |
|------|--|---------|------|-----------------|-------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| | | % | RILE | All | RILE | Left | Right | Other |
| 103 | Anti-Imperialism: Positive | 0.38 | L | | | | | |
| 105 | Military: Negative | 0.77 | L | | | | | |
| 106 | Peace: Positive | 0.82 | L | | | | | |
| 107 | Internationalism: Positive | 2.79 | L | | | | | |
| 202 | Democracy: Positive | 3.55 | L | 0.18 | 0.07 | 0.50 | 0.03 | 0.47 |
| 403 | Market Regulation: Positive | 2.04 | L | 0.29 | -0.03 | 0.75 | 0.12 | 0.14 |
| 404 | Economic Planning: Positive | 0.97 | L | 0.05 | -0.05 | 0.18 | 0.35 | 0.47 |
| 406 | Protectionism: Positive | 0.26 | L | | | | | |
| 412 | Controlled Economy: Positive | 0.71 | L | | | | | |
| 413 | Nationalization: Positive | 0.41 | L | | | | | |
| 504 | Welfare State Expansion: Positive | 7.19 | L | 0.50 | 0.10 | 0.68 | 0.03 | 0.29 |
| 506 | Education Expansion: Positive | 4.44 | L | 0.46 | n/a | 0.78 | 0.00 | 0.22 |
| 701 | Labour Groups: Positive | 2.51 | L | 0.14 | 0.05 | 0.45 | 0.08 | 0.47 |
| 104 | Military: Positive | 1.32 | R | | | | | |
| 201 | Freedom and Human Rights: Positive | 2.56 | R | | | | | |
| 203 | Constitutionalism: Positive | 0.59 | R | | | | | |
| 305 | Political Authority: Positive | 3.00 | R | 0.10 | 0.14 | 0.24 | 0.44 | 0.32 |
| 401 | Free Enterprise: Positive | 1.74 | R | | | | | |
| 402 | Incentives: Positive | 2.29 | R | 0.46 | 0.03 | 0.20 | 0.74 | 0.06 |
| 407 | Protectionism: Negative | 0.21 | R | | | | | |
| 414 | Economic Orthodoxy: Positive | 1.91 | R | 0.46 | 0.16 | 0.02 | 0.77 | 0.20 |
| 505 | Welfare State Limitation: Positive | 0.36 | R | | | | | |
| 601 | National Way of Life: Positive | 1.03 | R | | | | | |
| 603 | Traditional Morality: Positive | 1.41 | R | | | | | |
| 605 | Law and Order: Positive | 2.46 | R | 0.13 | n/a | 0.00 | 0.82 | 0.18 |
| 606 | Social Harmony: Positive | 1.44 | R | 0.44 | 0.24 | 0.03 | 0.71 | 0.26 |
| 101 | Foreign Special relationships: Positive | 0.77 | - | | | | | |
| 102 | Foreign Special relationships: Negative | 0.22 | - | | | | | |
| 108 | European Integration: Positive | 1.92 | - | | | | | |
| 109 | Internationalism: Negative | 0.40 | - | | | | | |
| 110 | European Integration: Negative | 0.43 | - | | | | | |
| 204 | Constitutionalism: Negative | 0.23 | - | | | | | |
| 301 | Decentralization: Positive | 3.19 | - | | | | | |
| 302 | Centralization: Positive | 0.16 | - | | | | | |
| 303 | Governmental and Administrative Efficiency: Positive | 4.60 | - | 0.02 | n/a | 0.47 | 0.00 | 0.53 |
| 304 | Political Corruption: Negative | 0.80 | - | | | | | |
| 405 | Corporatism: Positive | 0.27 | - | 0.21 | n/a | 0.25 | 0.00 | 0.75 |
| 408 | Economic Goals | 2.90 | - | 0.13 | 0.02 | 0.16 | 0.16 | 0.68 |
| 409 | Keynesian Demand Management: Positive | 0.19 | - | | | | | |
| 410 | Productivity: Positive | 2.14 | - | 0.17 | 0.12 | 0.01 | 0.16 | 0.83 |
| 411 | Technology and Infrastructure: Positive | 5.71 | - | 0.34 | 0.29 | 0.41 | 0.05 | 0.54 |

Continued on next page

| Code | Description | Overall | | Fleiss κ | | Pr(A* A) = | | |
|------|--|---------|------|-----------------|------|------------|-------|-------------|
| | | % | RILE | All | RILE | Left | Right | Other |
| 415 | Marxist Analysis: Positive | 0.09 | - | | | | | |
| 416 | Anti-Growth Economy: Positive | 0.69 | - | | | | | |
| 501 | Environmental Protection: Positive | 4.85 | - | | | | | |
| 502 | Culture: Positive | 3.04 | - | | | | | |
| 503 | Social Justice: Positive | 3.83 | - | 0.35 | 0.24 | 0.12 | 0.10 | 0.78 |
| 507 | Education Limitation: Positive | 0.04 | - | | | | | |
| 602 | National Way of Life: Negative | 0.21 | - | | | | | |
| 604 | Traditional Morality: Negative | 0.29 | - | | | | | |
| 607 | Multiculturalism: Positive | 0.80 | - | | | | | |
| 608 | Multiculturalism: Negative | 0.22 | - | | | | | |
| 702 | Labour Groups: Negative | 0.12 | - | | | | | |
| 703 | Farmers: Positive | 3.41 | - | 0.82 | 0.04 | 0.03 | 0.09 | 0.88 |
| 704 | Middle Class and Professional Groups: Positive | 0.86 | - | | | | | |
| 705 | Underprivileged Minority Groups: Positive | 1.44 | - | | | | | |
| 706 | Non-economic Demographic Groups: Positive | 4.20 | - | 0.29 | 0.11 | 0.17 | 0.08 | 0.75 |
| 000 | Uncoded | 4.79 | - | 0.11 | 0.10 | 0.41 | 0.14 | 0.45 |

Notes

1. Note: The “Overall % column refers to the proportion of coded quasi-sentences assigned to each category from the complete CMP dataset (from *MPP2*).
2. Categories are sorted so that the 13 “Rile-left” categories are listed first, the 13 “Rile-right” categories second, followed by the “Rile-other” categories. The probability that an individual policy category will be classified as belonging to its own “Rile” classification are highlighted in boldface. For quasi-sentences that really belong to “202: Democracy: Positive” for instance—a relative high-frequency category at 3.55% of all CMP quasi-sentences in the combined dataset—the probability is only 0.50 from our tests that it will be assigned a CMP code that is one of the 13 “Rile-left” categories. The probability is almost even (0.47) that it will be coded as a category that is not part of the “Rile” index, and just 0.03 that it will coded as a “Rile-right” category.
3. The limited set of categories in our test documents meant that we could only report misclassification probabilities for the 20 categories identified by the CMP’s Master coding.